# 1 Rewetting degraded peatlands for climate and biodiversity benefits: results from two

- 2 raised bogs
- 3

4 F. Renou-Wilson<sup>1</sup>, G. Moser<sup>2</sup>, D. Fallon<sup>3</sup>, C. A. Farrell<sup>3</sup>, C. Müller<sup>1,2</sup> and D. Wilson<sup>4\*</sup>

- 5 <sup>1</sup> School of Biology and Environmental Science, University College Dublin, Ireland
- 6 <sup>2</sup> Institute for Plant Ecology, Justus Liebig University Giessen, Germany
- <sup>3</sup> Bord na Móna, Leabeg, Tullamore, Co. Offaly, Ireland
- 8 <sup>4</sup> Earthy Matters Environmental Consultants, Glenvar, Co. Donegal, Ireland
- 9
- 10 \*Corresponding author. Email address david.wilson@earthymatters.ie
- 11

### 12 Abstract

Globally, peatlands are under threat from a range of land use related factors that have a 13 significant impact on the provision of ecosystem services, such as biodiversity and carbon (C) 14 sequestration/storage. In Ireland, approximately 84 % of raised bogs (a priority habitat listed 15 in Annex I of the EU Habitats Directive) have been affected by peat extraction. While 16 17 restoration implies the return of ecosystem services that were characteristic of the predisturbed ecosystem, achieving this goal is often a challenge in degraded peatlands as post-18 drainage conditions vary considerably between sites. Here, we present multi-year greenhouse 19 20 gas (GHG) and vegetation dynamics data from two former raised bogs in Ireland that were drained and either industrially extracted (milled) or cut on the margins for domestic use and 21 22 subsequently rewetted (with no further management). When upscaled to the ecosystem level, the rewetted nutrient poor domestic cutover peatland was a net sink of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) 23  $(-49 \pm 66 \text{ g C m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1})$  and a source of methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) (19.7 ± 5 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>), while the 24 nutrient rich industrial cutaway was a net source of CO<sub>2</sub> ( $0.66 \pm 168$  g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) and CH<sub>4</sub> 25  $(5.0 \pm 2.2 \text{ g C m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1})$ . The rewetted domestic cutover site exhibited the expected range of 26 micro-habitats and species composition found in natural (non-degraded) counterparts. In 27 contrast, despite successful rewetting, the industrially extracted peatland did not exhibit 28 29 typical raised bog flora. This study demonstrated that environmental and management 30 variables can influence species composition and, therefore, the regeneration of species typical of natural sites, and has highlighted the climate benefits from rewetting degraded peatlands in 31 32 terms of reduced GHG emissions. However, rewetting of degraded peatlands is a major

| 33  | challenge and in some cases reintroduction of bryophytes typical of natural raised bogs may |
|-----|---|
| 34  | be more difficult than the achievement of proper GHG emission savings.                      |
| 35  |   |
|     |   |
| 36  | Keywords: Climate, greenhouse gases, restoration, species diversity                         |
| 27  |   |
| 57  |   |
| 38  |   |
|     |   |
| 39  |   |
| 40  |   |
|     |   |
| 41  |   |
| 42  |   |
| 74  |   |
| 43  |   |
| лл  |   |
| 44  |   |
| 45  |   |
| 4.0 |   |
| 46  |   |
| 47  |   |
|     |   |
| 48  |   |
| 49  |   |
|     |   |
| 50  |   |
| 51  |   |
| 51  |   |
| 52  |   |
| 52  |   |
| 55  |   |
| 54  |   |
|     |   |
| 55  |   |

## 56 1. Introduction

Globally, peatlands and organic soils are under threat from a range of climatic and land use related factors that have a significant impact on the provision of ecosystem services, such as biodiversity (Lachance and Lavoie, 2004; Parish et al., 2008; Pasquet et al., 2015) and carbon (C) sequestration and storage (Beetz et al., 2013; Evans et al., 2014; Renou-Wilson et al., 2014; Tiemeyer et al., 2016).

In natural (i.e. not degraded) peatlands, permanently waterlogged conditions prevent 62 the complete decomposition of dead plant material, leading to the accumulation of C rich peat 63 64 (Page and Baird, 2016). Natural peatlands are generally net sinks for carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub> uptake) and sources of methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) emissions (Christensen et al., 2012; Roulet et al., 65 2007) and this interplay in gas exchange over millennia has played a major role in the 66 regulation and maintenance of the global climate (Frolking et al., 2006). Furthermore, 67 68 natural peatlands are an important global biodiversity resource as they provide niche habitats for a range of specialized fauna and flora (Chapman et al., 2003; Minayeva et al., 2017; 69 70 Parish et al., 2008).

Global emissions from land use change (e.g. deforestation, afforestation) are estimated at 3.67 Gt  $CO_2$  yr<sup>-1</sup> (Le Quéré et al., 2016), however this value does not include emissions associated with the drainage of peatlands and organic soils, or from peat fires (Houghton et al., 2012), which could potentially release an additional 0.9-3 Gt of  $CO_2$  to the atmosphere annually (Joosten et al., 2012; Smith et al., 2014). Furthermore, land use change has also led to the loss of 15 % of global peatland habitats over the last century (Barthelmes, 2016).

In Ireland, loss of peatland habitat through conversion to grassland, forestry and from 78 peat extraction (industrial and domestic peat extraction) is estimated at 85 % of the national 79 resource (Malone and O'Connell, 2009) and the most recent national monitoring survey 80 81 showed that 84 % of raised bogs (a priority habitat listed in Annex I of the EU Habitats Directive (EU Directive on the Conservation of Habitats, Flora and Fauna 92/43/EEC), have 82 been affected by peat extraction alone (NPWS, In press). Moreover, CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from 83 degraded Irish peatlands and from related peat activities (combustion of peat for energy, 84 horticulture) have been estimated at c. 11 to 12.4 Mt CO<sub>2</sub> each year (Barthelmes, 2016; 85 Wilson et al., 2013b), which is similar to annual emissions from the Irish transport sector 86 (Duffy et al., 2015). Critically, only 1,955 ha of raised bog in Ireland (~0.1 %) is considered 87

\*active' i.e. capable of C sequestration and continued peat formation (Fernandez et al.,
2014).

Rewetting of peat soils (i.e. by ditch blocking, creation of bunds etc.) has been 90 suggested as an important climate change mitigation tool to reduce emissions, to create 91 92 suitable conditions for C sequestration and to stimulate biodiversity (Bonn et al., 2014; Parish et al., 2008). However, a wide array of annual CO<sub>2</sub> (e.g. Knox et al., 2015; Renou-93 Wilson et al., 2016; Wilson et al., 2016b; Wilson et al., 2007b; Yli-Petäys et al., 2007), 94 CH<sub>4</sub> (e.g. Günther et al., 2015; Strack and Zuback, 2013; Vanselow-Algan et al., 2015) and 95 96 N<sub>2</sub>O (e.g. Dinsmore et al., 2009; Minke et al., 2016; Ye and Horwath, 2016) fluxes have been reported for rewetted peatlands, largely driven by differences between climate zones 97 (e.g. boreal, temperate and tropical) and nutrient status (Wilson et al., 2016a). Other factors 98 such as time since rewetting, current vegetation composition and previous land use 99 100 management are also likely to have a significant influence on GHG dynamics post-rewetting, although the extent of these effects may be highly site specific. 101

Rewetting and additional restoration measures have also the potential to re-instate the 102 103 original ecosystem services, such as water conservation, erosion and fire prevention; and co-104 benefits, such as enhanced biodiversity value of peatlands (Parish et al., 2008; Tanneberger 105 and Wichtmann, 2011), which themselves would contribute to climate change adaptation. For example, a specific Aichi Biodiversity Target (i.e. Target 15) to combat climate change and 106 107 biodiversity loss by the restoration of 15 % of degraded ecosystems by 2020 has been proposed by the Convention for Biological Diversity (CBD, 2010) with rewetting and 108 109 restoration of peatlands put forward as a specific instance of such a win-win outcome. While the biodiversity-climate change nexus is now well recognized (Parish et al., 2008), studies 110 111 pertaining to the restoration/rewetting of degraded peatlands still focus mostly on one single objective (mainly due to the fact that these are in protected areas) and do not demonstrate this 112 potential synergy (Andersen et al., 2016). 113

In this study, we appraised the climatic benefits from the rewetting of degraded 114 peatlands in terms of reduced GHG emissions (from multi-year data sets) and the possible 115 return of the C sequestration function, as well as the potential for increased biodiversity 116 provision with the aim of identifying the most optimum land use category for future peatland 117 restoration policies. We investigated two rewetted peatlands (originally raised bogs) within 118 the same biogeographical region but under different land uses: industrial peat extraction 119 (which accounts for 7 % of the peatland resource) vs drained/domestic peat extraction (38 % 120 of the peatland resource). We assessed whether rewetting of these degraded peatlands can 121

bring back the biological structure and ecosystem functions typical of a natural raised bog.
We hypothesise that both sites are currently on dissimilar successional stages and will,
therefore, exhibit contrasting biodiversity and climate benefits.

125

# 126 **2. Material and methods**

## 127 *2.1 Study areas*

Blackwater, Co. Offaly is located in the Irish Midlands (Supplemental Material (S1)) and is a 128 former raised bog that was drained for milled peat extraction in the late 1950s. At the 129 cessation of extraction in 1999, the drainage pumps were deactivated. Since then, the 130 landscape has developed spontaneously as a composite of microsites; bare peat fields (some 131 with active drainage systems), and re-colonized drained and rewetted areas (Fallon et al., 132 2012). The general hydrological and nutrient status of Blackwater is representative and 133 typical of the outcome of industrial peat extraction in Ireland (Farrell, 2008), and due to the 134 geographical location in the Irish midlands (a flat low-lying basin), rewetting of these sites 135 usually leads to the formation of shallow lakes. The average thickness of the residual peat 136 137 layer within the study site is 150 cm and the peat is composed mainly of highly humified *Phragmites* peat overlying limestone parent material (Table 1). 138

139

Moyarwood, Co. Galway is located in the west of the country (S1) and was ditched (similar 140 141 drainage network to Blackwater) in 1983 but never developed for peat extraction. However, significant degradation (subsidence) due to the drainage and from domestic peat extraction 142 143 around the margins of the bog and from burning events is evident. The topography is varied 144 but relatively flat on the eastern side where the GHG monitoring plots were established. The 145 drains were active until a rewetting programme commenced in 2012, which consisted of 146 blocking drains with peat dams at regular intervals (generally at any point where there was a fall in a drain level of 10 cm). A drained vegetated area remains on the margins of the bog. 147 The average thickness of the peat within the site is 440 cm and the peat is composed mainly 148 of humified Sphagnum peat overlying limestone parent material (Table 1). 149

150

151 *2.2 Climate* 

152 The sites are located within the temperate zone as defined by IPCC (2006) and are 153 characterized by an oceanic climate with prevailing south-west winds, mild mean annual air temperatures and moderately high annual rainfall. Although there is only 30 km distance
between the sites (S1), the 30-year mean annual air temperature (1980-2010) is slightly lower
at Blackwater (9.6 °C) strongly affected by lower winter temperatures in the area, while mean
annual precipitation is 245 mm higher in Moyarwood (Table 1). During the study, potential
evapotranspiration (PE; mm) ranged from 482 to 551 mm at Blackwater and from 502 to 517
mm at Moyarwood (Note: 30-year mean annual PE values are not available for the Met
stations at Gurteen (Blackwater) and Athenry (Moyarwood)).

**Table 1** Location, climate and physico-chemical characteristics\* of the two rewetted sites.

Air temperature and precipitation data (1981-2010) from Met Éireann, Gurteen station
(Blackwater) and Athenry station (Moyarwood).

| Site name                                      | Blackwater          | Moyarwood             |  |  |
|--|---------------------|-----------------------|--|--|
|  | Industrial peat     | Drained/domestic peat |  |  |
| Previous land use                              | extraction          | extraction            |  |  |
|  | (30 years)          | (30 years)            |  |  |
| Time of rewetting                              | 1999                | 2012                  |  |  |
| Latitude                                       | 53°17′48.9′´N       | 53° 20′49.2´´N        |  |  |
| Longitude                                      | 7°57′56.3′′W        | 8°30′55.4′′W          |  |  |
| Sub-region                                     | Midlands            | West                  |  |  |
| Mean annual air temperature (°C)               | 9.6                 | 9.9                   |  |  |
| Mean precipitation                             | 948                 | 1193                  |  |  |
| (IIIII yi )<br>Current neat tyne               | Phraomites          | Sphaonum              |  |  |
| von Post scale                                 | H7                  | H6                    |  |  |
| Parent material                                | Limestone           | Limestone             |  |  |
| Acrotelm                                       | Absent              | Present but subsided  |  |  |
| Peat depth (m)                                 | 1.5                 | 4.4                   |  |  |
| pH   | 4.9                 | 4.4                   |  |  |
| Electrical conductivity (µs cm <sup>-1</sup> ) | 350                 | 102                   |  |  |
| Bulk density (g cm <sup>-3</sup> ):            |                     |                       |  |  |
| - drained                                      | 0.19                | 0.13                  |  |  |
| - rewetted                                     | 0.14                | 0.08                  |  |  |
| C (%)  | 52.4                | 51.5                  |  |  |
| N (%)  | 2.14                | 1.32                  |  |  |
| C:N  | 24.5                | 39                    |  |  |
| Study period                                   | 1/5/2011: 30/4/2015 | 1/4/2013: 31/3/2015   |  |  |
| Number of GHG plots:                           |                     |                       |  |  |
| -drained                                       | 3                   | 3                     |  |  |
| -rewetted                                      | 11                  | 12                    |  |  |

\*See Renou-Wilson et al. (2018) and related technical report for details regarding soil sampling.

166

#### 167 *2.3 Field measurements*

#### 168 2.3.1 Biodiversity assessment

The hydro-ecological state of each site was assessed on the basis of a habitat assessment, survey of plant communities and indicator species (positive and negative). Four key abiotic and biotic components of biodiversity assessment were identified for the appraisal of the restored/rewetted status of each site, namely 1) hydrological integrity (see details in Renou-Wilson et al., 2018); 2) physico-chemical parameters of peat and drain water (pH, C:N, bulk density, electrical conductivity); 3); micro-habitat assessment (heterogeneity and condition); and 4) vegetation composition (species and abundance).

176 The relative presence of different micro-habitat types (hummocks, pools, hollows, lawns and flats) provide a measure for habitat heterogeneity in typical raised bogs (Schouten, 177 2002). In order to carry out the assessment of the biotic components, five habitat quadrats 178 "HQ" (4 x 4 m plot) were established along a "W" shape transect through representative 179 areas of each site, running perpendicular to the main drainage systems. In each HQ, the 180 vegetation was described by identifying the percentage cover of the main plant functional 181 182 types (PFT): woody vegetation; ericoid dwarf shrubs, total graminoids (grasses, sedges, forbs), bryophytes (Sphagnum mosses, other mosses, liverworts), lichens (demonstrating 183 184 absence of burning events), litter and bare peat. Four peat samples and the nearest drain water were also sampled for analysis. Furthermore, the four corners of each HQ formed a 185 vegetation quadrat "VQ" (1 x 1 m) and, therefore, 20 vegetation quadrats were also identified 186 at each site in order to assess the fourth component of our survey method. All taxa of vascular 187 plants, mosses and lichens and their cover values were recorded at each VQ. Algae were 188 recorded but not identified. Cover of each species within a VQ was estimated using a revised 189 Domin scale (Kent and Coker, 1992). The scale includes cover values from 0 to 4, whereby 190 0=absent, 1=rare (<5 %), 2=occasionally (5-20 %), 3=frequently (21-50 %) and 4=dominant 191 192 (>50 %).

Species richness and the Shannon-Wiener Index were determined as indicators of vegetation diversity for each site and were both determined as mean values of the 20 VQs. Species richness was further determined in total species number, total vascular plant species number and total bryophyte species number per site. Dominant PFTs and species for each study site were determined on the basis of the respective cover value medians per VQ. Coverweighted means of Ellenberg Indicator Values (EIV) were calculated from the VQ data for soil moisture, acidity and nitrogen (Ellenberg and Leuschner, 2010). Indicator values that
were unknown or not considered in Ellenberg's publication were based on Hill et al. (1999)
or Hill et al. (2007). Nomenclature for vascular plants follows Parnell and Curtis (2012),
Atherton et al. (2010) for bryophytes, and Whelan (2011) for lichens.

203

### 204 2.3.2 Environmental monitoring

Weather stations (WatchDog Model 2400; Spectrum Technologies Inc., Aurora, IL, USA) 205 206 were established at each site and recorded photosynthetic photon flux density (PPFD; µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) and soil temperature (°C) at 5, 10 and 20 cm depths at 10-min intervals. Additional 207 soil loggers (Hobo External Data Loggers; Onset Computer Corporation, Bourne, MA, USA) 208 209 were installed at each site to capture potential variation in soil temperatures between drained and rewetted microsites and recorded hourly soil temperatures (°C) at 5, 10 and 20 cm 210 depths. Water table levels (WT) were manually measured from perforated dipwells (internal 211 diameter 2 cm) that were inserted adjacent to each GHG measurement collar at fortnightly or 212 213 monthly intervals and linearly interpolated between measurement days to provide continuous data (Alm et al., 2007; Wilson et al., 2015). Wooden boardwalks were established at each 214 215 site to facilitate GHG measurements and to prevent damage to the vegetation and compression of the peat. At Blackwater, the boardwalks on the northern side of the collars 216 217 were elevated (~1 m from the ground) to facilitate the installation of extension chambers over 218 the Phragmites plants.

219

# 220 2.3.3 GHG monitoring

Blackwater: In 2011, 15 square stainless steel collars (60 x 60 cm) with a channel at the top were inserted to a depth of 30 cm into the peat in the following microsites: reeds (*Phragmites australis;* n=8), sedges (*Carex rostrata, Eriophorum angustifolium*; n=3) and drained bare peat (n=3). Although open water accounts for approximately one-third of the rewetted area, gas monitoring plots were not established there for logistical reasons.

Moyarwood: A total of 15 collars were established in early 2013 with 12 located in the rewetted area along a transect perpendicular to the ditches. One collar in the rewetted transect was suspended within a ditch, supported on wooden batons that extended across the ditch. The collar was placed in a similar manner to the other collars so that the channel at the top of the collar was above the water level. As per IPCC guidance (IPCC, 2014), former ditches

were not considered as being separate from the remainder of a rewetted site, and in this 231 instance the collar located in the ditch was considered part of the transect. The vegetation in 232 the collars was representative of the habitats found in the wider site, i.e. flats with some 233 Sphagnum lawn and a few hummocks. Three monitoring plots were located in the drained 234 area on the eastern margin, which was dominated by poorly growing heather (Calluna 235 vulgaris) and lichens (Cladonia spp.). Collars were not established in drainage ditches in the 236 drained areas at either site for logistical reasons; instead we use the IPCC default emission 237 (IPCC, 2014) ditches in factors for drained peatlands where appropriate. 238 239

240 Greenhouse gas fluxes were measured at fortnightly or monthly intervals from May 2011 to April 2015 at Blackwater and from April 2013 to March 2015 at Moyarwood. Each 241 measurement campaign consisted of 2-4 days. Net ecosystem exchange (NEE) was measured 242 with a static transparent polycarbonate chamber (60 x 60 x 33 cm) equipped with two internal 243 244 fans to ensure mixing of the headspace air. Vent holes on the chambers ensured that pressure artefacts and ebullition (for methane) were minimised during chamber placement. At 245 Blackwater, extension chambers (Günther et al., 2015; Wilson et al., 2007b) equipped with 246 fans were used for collars that contained *Phragmites australis*. A radiator cooling system 247 (with submerged ice packs) was used to maintain the temperature within the chamber close to 248 249 the ambient air temperature (Alm et al., 2007), and PPFD was recorded from a sensor (PAR-1; PP Systems, King's Lynn, Norfolk, UK) located in the chamber. NEE was measured under 250 a range of light levels (PPFD;  $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) as the position of the sun changed throughout the 251 day. In early mornings, an artificial shroud that blocked approximately 50 % of incoming 252 PPFD was placed over the chamber to permit the measurement of NEE at low PPFD levels 253 (<100  $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>). CO<sub>2</sub> measurements were carried out between 8 am and 6 pm in the 254 summer and between 9 am and 3 pm in the winter to ensure that the maximum PPFD was 255 reached at each measurement date. Ecosystem respiration (Reco) was then measured by 256 covering the chamber in an opaque cover and  $CO_2$  exchange was measured as outlined above. 257

Methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) and nitrous oxide (N<sub>2</sub>O) fluxes were measured at monthly intervals (multiple measurements were carried out during the 4 day measurement campaigns in summer) using an opaque, polycarbonate chamber ( $60 \times 60 \times 25$  cm) equipped with a batteryoperated fan that mixed the air within the chamber headspace. As for CO<sub>2</sub> sampling, extension chambers were used in the reed microsite at Blackwater. For a more detailed description of GHG sampling approach and laboratory analysis see Wilson et al. (2013a). To incorporate the seasonal dynamics of the vegetation into  $CO_2$  exchange models, a green area index (GAI) was estimated for each of the vegetated collars. In brief, this involved measuring the green photosynthetic area of all vascular plants (leaves and stems) within five sub-sample plots (8 cm x 8 cm) in the GHG collar at monthly intervals. Moss % cover was estimated at the same time. Species-specific model curves were applied to describe the phenological dynamics of the vegetation of each collar, and the models (vascular plants and moss) were summed to produce a plot-specific GAI (see Wilson et al., 2007a)

271

### 272 2.3.4 Flux calculations

Flux rates (mg CO<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup>, mg CH<sub>4</sub> m<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup>,  $\mu$ g N<sub>2</sub>O m<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup>) were calculated as the linear 273 slope of the CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O concentrations in the chamber headspace over time, with 274 respect to the chamber volume, collar area and air temperature. A flux was accepted if the 275 coefficient of determination  $(r^2)$  was at least 0.90. An exception was made in cases where the 276 flux was close to zero for e.g. in early morning/late evening when there are light constraints 277 278 on photosynthetic activity or in winter time when soil processes are typically slower and the  $r^2$  is always low (Alm et al., 2007). In these cases, the flux data were examined graphically 279 and fluxes with obvious nonlinearity (due to chamber leakage, fan malfunction, ebullition, 280 etc.) were discarded. The remainder were were evaluated using Akaike's Information 281

Criterion for small sample sizes (AICc) and fluxes that exhibited low AICc values (representing lower variance and better model fitting) were accepted. In this study, we followed the sign convention whereby positive values indicate a flux from the peatland to the atmosphere (source) and negative values indicate a flux from the atmosphere to the peatland (sink). Gross primary production (GPP) was calculated as NEE minus  $R_{eco}$  (Alm et al., 2007) and the closest  $R_{eco}$  flux value in time to a NEE flux value was used with care taken to ensure that air (within the chamber) and soil temperatures were similar at the time of measurement.

289

# 290 *2.3.5 Modelling*

Statistical and physiological response models were constructed and parameterized for each microsite within the study sites (see S2). Model evaluation was based on the following criteria: (1) statistically significant model parameters (p < 0.05), (2) lowest possible standard error of the model parameters and (3) highest possible coefficient of determination (adjusted  $r^2$ ). During model construction, the relationship between R<sub>eco</sub>, GPP, CH<sub>4</sub> or N<sub>2</sub>O and a range of independent environmental variables (recorded in conjunction with flux measurements) 297 was tested. Only variables that increased the explanatory power of the model were included. The models were accepted if the residuals were evenly scattered around zero. GPP was 298 related to PPFD using the Michaelis–Menten-type relationship that describes the saturating 299 response of photosynthesis to light (Tuittila et al., 1999), and to GAI and/or water table 300 (S2a). GPP model coefficients and associated standard errors were estimated using the 301 Levenberg-Marquardt multiple nonlinear regression technique (IBM SPSS Statistics for 302 Windows, version 21.0, Armonk, NY, USA). The Reco models are based upon the Arrhenius 303 equation (Lloyd and Taylor, 1994) and are nonlinear models related to soil temperature and 304 305 water table or volumetric moisture content (S2b). The CH<sub>4</sub> models are nonlinear models related to soil temperature and water table (S2c). 306

307

## 308 2.3.6 Annual GHG balances

The response functions estimated for R<sub>eco</sub>, GPP and CH<sub>4</sub> were used for the reconstruction of 309 the annual GHG balances for the drained and rewetted areas. Fluxes were reconstructed for 310 each sample plot in combination with an hourly time series of (1)  $T_{5cm}$ , (2) WT levels linearly 311 interpolated from weekly measurements, (3) PPFD values recorded by the weather station 312 and (4) plot-specific modelled GAI that described the phenological development of the 313 vegetation. Annual NEE was calculated as the sum of annual GPP (negative values) and 314 annual R<sub>eco</sub> (positive values). Annual balances (g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) were calculated for each sample 315 plot by integrating the hourly values over each 12-month period. Annual CO<sub>2</sub> balances from 316 the drained areas in both sites were previously reported in Wilson et al. (2015) and here we 317 318 provide an additional year of CO<sub>2</sub> data from both sites.

319

#### 320 *2.3.7 Upscaling*

High resolution habitat maps were created for each site. A vegetation and habitat mapping 321 survey was carried out and aerial colour photographs at a scale of 1:6000 were used as a base 322 map. The minimum habitat unit size for the survey was set at 0.5 ha. Habitat classifications 323 (Fossitt, 2000) were applied on site using the aerial photos as a guide. Features on the ground, 324 such as vegetation, watercourses and roads were recorded. Once the field work was 325 completed, the maps were digitised using Arc Map10 GIS package, with every unit (in this 326 case vegetation communities, open water, roads etc.) mapped digitally. Guidelines as outlined 327 by Smith et al. (2011) were followed. At Blackwater, the proportion of reeds, sedges and 328 open water in the rewetted site were 13, 57, and 30 % respectively. At Moyarwood, the 329

vegetation was relatively homogenous across the site and so the mean annual  $CO_2$  and  $CH_4$ balances from the collars were scaled up to an area of one hectare.

332

# 333 2.3.8 Statistical analysis

334 Statistical analyses were performed using SPSS version 21.0 for Windows (IBM SPSS Statistics for Windows, Armonk, NY, USA). P values smaller than 0.05 were considered 335 statistically significant. All data were tested for normality using the Kolmogorov-Smirnov 336 test. Where the data were not normally distributed, the repeated-measures Friedman and 337 338 Wilcoxon signed-rank nonparametric tests were used. Uncertainty in reconstructed annual Reco and NEE was calculated by summing up the maximum and minimum standard errors 339 (Renou-Wilson et al., 2014). The species abundance data of rewetted plots in Blackwater and 340 Moyarwood and intact raised bogs were analyzed with multivariate statistics using Canoco 341 4.5. The initial detrended correspondence (DCA) analysis revealed a gradient on the first axis 342 that was longer than 5 SD units. Therefore, the unimodal DCA model of species distribution 343 along gradients was applied. 344

345

# 346 *2.3.9 Synergies*

347 The outcome of rewetting / restoration activities are very site specific, which makes valuation of the ecosystem services provided by these sites a challenge (Glenk et al., 2014). 348 349 Nevertheless, a robust valuation is needed if current land use management and alternative uses are to be compared for local, regional or national policy development, where it is critical 350 351 to simplify the links between functional processes, such as the condition of the vegetation (composition and cover) and habitats, and the related ecosystem services. We assigned a 352 353 ranking (1-5) to six metrics (measured in this study) under the categories of climate change mitigation and biodiversity provision. The criteria used to determine the rankings are defined 354 in Table 2. Scaling within the rankings was assigned based on the range in values generally 355 reported in the scientific literature for each metric, although we are cognisant that there is a 356 level of subjectivity to the way that they are used here. For comparative purposes, a ranking 357 of 5 is commensurate to a natural raised bog in most of the metrics. For CH<sub>4</sub>, a ranking of 3 is 358 359 more applicable for a temperate natural site (e.g. Goodrich et al., 2015; Green and Baird, 2017). 360

- 361
- 362
- 363

**Table 2**. Criteria used to determine rankings (1-5) for the decision matrix. Positive values for

365 carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>), methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) and nitrous oxide (N<sub>2</sub>O) indicate net losses from the

| Metric          | Units                | Ranking    |             |            |           |          |
|-----------------|----------------------|------------|-------------|------------|-----------|----------|
|                 |                      | 1          | 2           | 3          | 4         | 5        |
| Climate change  |                      |            |             |            |           |          |
| CO <sub>2</sub> | $g C m^{-2} yr^{-1}$ | > 90       | 90- 61      | 60-31      | 30-1      | $\leq 0$ |
| $CH_4$          | $g C m^{-2} yr^{-1}$ | > 30       | 30-21       | 20-11      | 10-1      | $\leq 0$ |
| $N_2O$          | $g N m^{-2} yr^{-1}$ | > 1        | 0.9 to 0.61 | 0.6-0.31   | 0.3-0.1   | $\leq 0$ |
| Biodiversity    |                      |            |             |            |           |          |
| Micro-habitat   |                      | 0.4 - 0.5  | 0 ( +- 1    | 114-0      | 0.1.4- 0  | . 2      |
| diversity       | -                    | 0 to 0.5   | 0.6 to 1    | 1.1 to 2   | 2.1 to 3  | > 3      |
| Bryophyte no.   | -                    | <3         | 3 to 4      | 5 to 6     | 7 to 8    | >9       |
| Shannon Wiener  |                      | 0.4 - 0.00 | 1 ( - 1 00  | 2 ( - 2 00 | 2 + 2 00  | . 4      |
| Index           | -                    | 0 to 0.99  | 1 to 1.99   | 2 to 2.99  | 3 to 3.99 | >4       |

peatland to the atmosphere and negative values (< 0) indicate net uptake by the peatland.

- 367
- 368

## **369 3. Results**

### 370 *3.1 Weather*

371 A distinct seasonal pattern in air and soil temperatures was evident in both sites throughout the study (Fig. 1). At Blackwater, the lowest air temperature values (-7 °C) occurred during 372 the winter of 2012/2013 (Fig. 1a), with highest air temperatures (29 °C) recorded in mid-373 summer 2013. Average annual air temperatures for each 12-month period were 9.8, 8.7, 10 374 and 9.7 with year 2 and 3 varying considerably from the long-term average (Table 1). At 375 376 Moyarwood, the lowest air temperature (-4 °C) was recorded in April 2013 and the highest 377 (29 °C) in mid-summer 2013 (Fig. 1b). Soil temperatures at both sites displayed the same seasonal patterns as air temperatures but were subject to less hourly variation in both the 378 drained and rewetted areas. 379



380

Fig. 1 Hourly air (grey line) and soil temperatures (°C) at (a) Blackwater and (b) Moyarwood
for the duration of the study. Soil temperatures are from 5cm depth in the drained (blue line)
and rewetted (yellow line) areas of the study sites.

At Blackwater, rainfall for each 12-month period; 949 mm, 1049 mm, 949 mm and 926 mm was similar to the long term average (Table 1), although rainfall distribution varied considerably between years with the summer of 2013 much drier than the others (Fig. 2). At Moyarwood, the rainfall in the first year of the study (1425 mm) was 19 % higher than the long-term average, driven by wetter summer and winter conditions, while the second year (1193 mm) was similar to the long-term average.

# 390 *3.2 Hydrological and physico-chemical parameters*

Both rewetted sites displayed a similar moisture profile with the water table at or just below the ground surface (Fig. 2). Water table levels displayed spatial and temporal variability over the monitoring periods (Fig. 2). All the rewetted plots displayed annual mean WT levels above -20 cm throughout the study and are confirmed as hydrologically restored. In 2013, the WT in the rewetted areas in Blackwater dropped below -20 cm for 3 months (Fig. 2a), although a similar response was not observed in Moyarwood at the same time (Fig. 2b). The WT in the drained areas of both sites were subject to considerable fluctuations throughout the





400

Fig. 2 Monthly rainfall (mm; hatched bars) and water table levels (cm) in the rewetted (black
line) and drained (grey line) areas in (a) Blackwater (April 2011 to April 2015) and (b)
Moyarwood (April 2013 to April 2015).

Blackwater had a pH of approximately 5 and a high von Post value associated with *Phragmites* peat (Table 1). This mesotrophic status is due to its basal fen peat now exposed to the surface after peat extraction and which is also more nutrient rich (C:N = 25). This was corroborated by the analysis of surface water that showed high pH (7.4) and electrical conductivity (316  $\mu$ s cm<sup>-1</sup>) values. In comparison, the surface layer of Moyarwood was more acidic (pH 4.4) and nutrient poor (C:N = 39) with oligotrophic surface water of low pH (4.3) and low electrical conductivity (59.8  $\mu$ s cm<sup>-1</sup>).

411

# 412 *3.3 Habitat and vegetation profile*

413 Blackwater lacked micro-habitat heterogeneity as no typical raised bog micro-habitats were 414 recorded in the surveyed part of the site. Moyarwood displayed a range of typical micro415 habitats (mean of 2.4 types of habitats, such as hummocks, hollows, lawns, and flats per habitat quadrat) but had no pools (Table 3). The proportion of vascular and bryophyte species 416 differed between sites and was not necessarily reflected in the total species number (Table 3). 417 Moyarwood had three times more bryophytes than Blackwater but the latter had the highest 418 number of total species (27 versus 21). The species spread also varied as shown by the ratio 419 of 'species number per plot: total species number': Blackwater displayed a low ratio (18 %) 420 indicating that some species occurred only together. At Moyarwood, 50 % or more of all 421 species occurred at all plots. The Shannon Wiener Index was higher at Moyarwood (2.26) 422 423 than at Blackwater (1.34).

424 **Table 3** Biodiversity variables, dominant Plant Functional Types (PFT), and dominant

425 species recorded at both rewetted sites. Micro-habitat diversity: mean of different types

426 present per quadrat; Ellenberg Index Values (EIV) for moisture, acidity and nitrogen are unit

427 less.

| Site name                         | Blackwater           | Moyarwood              |  |  |
|-----------------------------------|----------------------|------------------------|--|--|
| Micro-habitat diversity           | 0                    | 2.4                    |  |  |
| Total species                     | 27                   | 21                     |  |  |
| Bryophyte species                 | 3                    | 9                      |  |  |
| Bryophyte/total species ratio     | 0.11                 | 0.43                   |  |  |
| Shannon Wiener Index              | 1.34                 | 2.26                   |  |  |
| Dominant PFTs in habitat quadrats | Sedges               | Sedges                 |  |  |
|                                   | Litter               | Ericoids/Sphagnum      |  |  |
| Dominant species in vegetation    | Carex rostrata       | Calluna vulgaris       |  |  |
| quadrats                          | Phragmites australis | Sphagnum capillifolium |  |  |
| EIV moisture                      | 8.4                  | 8.0                    |  |  |
| EIV acidity                       | 4.5                  | 2.0                    |  |  |
| EIV nitrogen                      | 3.5                  | 1.5                    |  |  |

<sup>428</sup> 

Woody species, ferns and algae were absent in Moyarwood and only detected in very low 429 numbers in Blackwater. The most dominant plant functional types (PFTs) at both sites were 430 'sedges' but with different combination of species occurring, namely Eriophorum vaginatum 431 432 and E. angustifolium with Carex panicea in Moyarwood compared to the sedge combination of Carex rostrata and E. angustifolium in Blackwater. The second most dominant PFTs in 433 Moyarwood were ericoids and Sphagnum mosses (in particular Sphagnum capillifolium) 434 while plant litter was detected in high amounts at Blackwater. While very common moss 435 species, such as Polytrichum commune and Campylopus introflexus regularly occurred in the 436 more degraded Blackwater site, the fen-specialized bryophyte Campylium stellatum was also 437

438 present. Although not recorded in the quadrats, Sphagnum subnitens was observed on very small patches and is known to colonize wet cutaway peatlands after sedges and rushes. At 439 Moyarwood, hummocks were widespread but not very large and were associated with species 440 such as S. capillifolium, S. magellanicum, S. papillosum and Hypnum cupressiforme. Another 441 indicator species of healthy natural raised bogs is S. fuscum, which was found on one 442 hummock. The average EIVs across all vegetation plots for Moyarwood indicated that the 443 site was wet, quite acidic and infertile. In contrast, Blackwater had higher moisture, acidity 444 and nitrogen EIVs demonstrating that while being very wet, the peat was more nutrient-rich, 445 446 akin to a 'fen'.

At Moyarwood, species indicative of drier past conditions, for example an abundant 447 cover of Narthecium ossifragum, Trichophorum caespitosum and E. vaginatum, while C. 448 panicea, a negative indicator particularly in true "Midlands raised bogs" occurred on all 449 450 vegetation quadrats. Of great significance was the absence of common alien (invasive) species at both sites. Invasive species are considered to be the main direct drivers of 451 biodiversity loss in Europe and a threat to natural habitats in Ireland in particular (Caffrey et 452 al., 2014). Lichens (mostly *Cladonia portentosa*), an indicator of the absence of fire events, 453 454 were present at Moyarwood but not Blackwater. When comparing our results with typical 455 natural raised bogs that were located in the same region of the studied sites (data extracted from Renou-Wilson et al., 2011), we can assess the success or failure of each site vis-à-vis 456 457 ultimate objectives of rewetting/restoration. The radar graphics in Fig. 3 display the mean cover of PFTs for both sites compared with a typical natural site. Sphagnum mosses, ericoid 458 459 and sedges formed a typical assemblage of PFTs in Moyarwood in similar proportion to a natural site, except for the higher cover of sedges and the presence of non-Sphagnum mosses. 460 461 The PFT profile at Moyarwood had the closest resemblance with that of a natural raised bog. In contrast, Blackwater vegetation demonstrated a clear divergent pattern with 462 'sedges/rushes' as dominant PFT. 463

464



466 Fig. 3 Spider plot of Plant Functional Types percentage cover recorded at an intact Raised
467 Bog (RB) and at Blackwater and Moyarwood.

The multivariate analysis of the species abundance data via DCA resulted in a sum of all 468 eigenvalues of 4.752 (Axis 1: 0.903, Axis 2: 0.432). The gradient length of axis 1 was 5.315 469 and 3.327 for axis 2. The cumulative percentage variance of species data for the first four axis 470 was: 19.0, 28.1, 33.3 and 36.9. In the DCA biplot of species and samples (Fig. 4), the high 471 similarity and homogeneity of species composition between rewetted Moyarwood plots and 472 intact raised bogs was clearly observable from the overlapping sample cloud and the 473 474 dominance of Sphagnum species. The rewetted Blackwater plots showed a higher heterogeneity in species composition, which was in parts dominated by P. australis. The 475 476 distance of the Blackwater samples to the next intact raised bog sample was greater than 2-5 477 SD units, showing medium to high dissimilarity of the species composition between them.

478

465

479

480



482

481

Fig. 4 Detrended correspondence analysis (DCA) biplot of species and sample plots at both
rewetted sites and an intact raised bog. Sum of all eigenvalues of 4.752 (Axis 1: 0.903, Axis
2: 0.432).

486

#### 487 *3.4 Green area index (GAI)*

At Blackwater, average (± standard deviation) GAI values in the GHG collars ranged from 0 488 (non-growing season) to  $4.6 \pm 1.1 \text{ m}^2 \text{ m}^{-2}$  in the reeds, and from 0 to  $0.8 \pm 0.2 \text{ m}^2 \text{ m}^{-2}$  in the 489 sedge microsite (Fig. 5a). The drained area at Blackwater was unvegetated. There were 490 noticeable differences between years in regard to the start and finish of the growing season, 491 and the maximum GAI value observed in mid-summer (Fig. 5a). The amount of green plant 492 surface available for photosynthesis over the growing season, as determined by the area under 493 the GAI curves, varied considerably between years and followed the trend: 494 2011>2012>2013>2014. This trend was also evident in the sedge microsite. At Moyarwood, 495 the shape of the GAI curves and average GAI values were similar in both years in the drained 496 and rewetted areas (Fig. 5b), and ranged from 0.6 to  $0.9 \pm 0.3 \text{ m}^2 \text{ m}^{-2}$  in the former and from 497  $0.3 \text{ to } 0.8 \pm 0.4 \text{ m}^2 \text{ m}^{-2}$  in the latter. 498



500

501 **Fig. 5** Average modelled green area index (GAI;  $m^2 m^{-2}$ ) in (a) Blackwater and (b)

- 502 Moyarwood. Grey lines indicate  $\pm$  standard deviation (SD) of the mean.
- 503

# 504 3.5 Annual GHG balances

505 *3.5.1 Carbon dioxide fluxes* 

The drained areas in both sites were a net annual CO<sub>2</sub> source in all years of the study (Fig. 6a and 6d). At Blackwater, CO<sub>2</sub> emissions (in the absence of a vegetation component R<sub>eco</sub> and NEE are analogous) were highest in year 3 (185 ± 8 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) and lowest in year 2 (111 ± 5 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>). The 4-year average (± standard error) was 151 ± 11 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>. At Moyarwood, R<sub>eco</sub> was higher than GPP in both years in the drained area and resulted in net CO<sub>2</sub> losses of 115 ± 26 g and 159 ± 23 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> in years 1 and 2 respectively. The 2-year average was 137 ± 24 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>.

The reed microsite at Blackwater was a very strong  $CO_2$  sink in the first two years of the study; -271 ± 92 and -255 ± 118 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> (Fig. 6b). In year 3, R<sub>eco</sub> increased by 45 % and GPP dropped by 24 % from the values estimated in the previous year. This produced a very strong  $CO_2$  source of 248 ± 86 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>. In year 4, both R<sub>eco</sub> and GPP decreased and the microsite was a smaller CO<sub>2</sub> source of  $129 \pm 124$  g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>. Average NEE (4-year) for the reed microsite was  $-37 \pm 229$  g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>. The sedge microsite followed the same trend as the reed microsite; a small CO<sub>2</sub> sink in years 1 and 2, and a strong CO<sub>2</sub> source in years 3 and 4 (Fig. 6c). Average NEE (4-year) for the sedge microsite was  $90 \pm 68$  g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>. Average NEE for the rewetted area (excluding open water) was estimated at  $66 \pm 168$  g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>.



522

**Fig. 6** Average annual modelled net ecosystem exchange (NEE), gross photosynthesis (GPP) and ecosystem respiration ( $R_{eco}$ ) and (g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) ± standard errors in Blackwater (left side panels) and Moyarwood (right side panels). Positive values indicate net loss of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) from the peatland to the atmosphere and negative values indicate net CO<sub>2</sub> uptake by the peatland.

528 At Moyarwood, the rewetted area was a CO<sub>2</sub> sink in both years of the study (Fig. 6e). 529 R<sub>eco</sub> was similar between years, although GPP was 20 % higher in the second year. Average 530 NEE (2-year) for the rewetted area was estimated at  $-49 \pm 68$  g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>.

# 531 *3.5.2 Methane and nitrous oxide fluxes*

Methane fluxes at the drained area in Blackwater were below the detection level of our 532 equipment, so a value of zero was assigned (Fig. 7). Both rewetted microsites in Blackwater 533 were annual CH<sub>4</sub> sources in all years of the study (Fig. 7). Emissions ranged from 6.7 to 9 g 534 C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> in the reed microsite and 4.2 to 4.5 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> in the sedge microsite. Average 535 CH<sub>4</sub> emissions for the upscaled rewetted area at Blackwater (excluding open water) were 536 estimated at 5.0  $\pm$  2.2 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>. At Moyarwood, average annual CH<sub>4</sub> emissions (linearly 537 interpolated between measurements) in the drained area were 0.77 g  $\pm$  0.49 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> (Fig. 538 7). Average CH<sub>4</sub> emissions for the rewetted area were 19.7  $\pm$  5 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>. Nitrous oxide 539 (N<sub>2</sub>O) fluxes were below the detection level of the equipment throughout the study period 540 and were therefore assigned a value of zero. 541



542

**Fig. 7** Average annual modelled  $CH_4$  fluxes (g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) ± standard error in Blackwater (B) and Moyarwood (M). Methane fluxes at the drained area in Blackwater were below the detection level of our equipment, so a value of zero was assigned.

- 546
- 547

#### 548 *3.5.2 Synergies*

In the decision matrix, climate change benefits from rewetting were slightly higher at Moyarwood where the site was ranked at 5 (maximum) for both  $CO_2$  and  $N_2O$  (Table 4). For CH<sub>4</sub>, it ranked lower than Blackwater reflecting the disparity in annual CH<sub>4</sub> emissions between the two sites. However, in term of biodiversity provision, Moyarwood was over twice as high as Blackwater, in particular for micro-habitat diversity and bryophyte numbers. Overall, Moyarwood ranked 1.5 times higher than Blackwater.

- **Table 4** Decision matrix for ecosystem services; climate change mitigation and biodiversity
- provision for the Blackwater and Moyarwood sites. See Table 2 for criteria used to determinerankings.

|              | Clin            | Climate change mitigation |                  |               | Biodiversity                   |                       |                            |               |                  |  |
|--------------|-----------------|---------------------------|------------------|---------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------|---------------|------------------|--|
| Site/Service | CO <sub>2</sub> | CH <sub>4</sub>           | N <sub>2</sub> O | Sub-<br>total | Micro-<br>habitat<br>diversity | Bryophytes<br>species | Shannon<br>Wiener<br>Index | Sub-<br>total | Overall<br>total |  |
| Blackwater   | 2               | 4                         | 5                | 11            | 1                              | 2                     | 2                          | 5             | 16               |  |
| Moyarwood    | 5               | 3                         | 5                | 13            | 4                              | 5                     | 3                          | 12            | 25               |  |

558

559

#### 560 4. Discussion

Restoration has been defined as "assisting the recovery of an ecosystem that has been 561 degraded, damaged or destroyed" and can be viewed as a process and/or an outcome 562 (McDonald et al., 2016); both with well-defined goals (Rochefort, 2000). In terms of the 563 latter, the widest possible range of ecosystem services is re-established and the "new" 564 ecosystem looks and functions similar to a historical pre-disturbed/degraded ecosystem (i.e. 565 the target reference state), although a future driven focus has also been proposed (e.g. Martin-566 Ortega et al., 2017). However, in peatlands where much of the peat has been extracted (e.g. 567 the raised bogs used for industrial peat extraction), this goal is impossible to achieve (at least 568 in the short- and medium term) and the development of a fen ecosystem is a more feasible 569 option (e.g. Cobbaert et al., 2004; Rochefort et al., 2016). Clearly, it is important to establish 570

571 at the outset the criteria by which success will be evaluated and to thereby determine the position of a particular site on a restoration trajectory (Andersen et al., 2016). While 572 cognisant that other key components of peatland functioning, such as microbial community 573 structure (e.g. Urbanová et al., 2011), faunal composition (e.g. Hannigan et al., 2011), water 574 quality (Martin-Ortega et al., 2017) and water borne carbon exports (e.g. Waddington et al., 575 2008), for example, were not quantified in this study, the two sites in this study, nonetheless, 576 provide a valuable case study in regard to peatland restoration given that they were both 577 raised bogs prior to disturbance (of varying intensity) but have plainly developed along 578 579 fundamentally different restoration trajectories with dissimilar hydrological regimes, vegetation composition and GHG dynamics. 580

581

# 582 4.1 Hydrological regime

From a hydrological standpoint both sites have been successfully rewetted, as ascertained by 583 the water table remaining at, just below or above the surface for the majority of the study 584 period (Fig. 2), as well as by the high EIV moisture values associated with the current 585 vegetation (Table 3). Species assemblages that form active raised bog require a mean water 586 level near or above the surface of the bog lawns for most of the year (Robroek et al., 2007). 587 588 In addition, seasonal fluctuations should not exceed 20 cm in amplitude and should only be 10 cm below the surface except for very short periods of time (NPWS, In press). Overall, the 589 590 two sites have been successfully 're-plumbed' and both the "passive" rewetting at Blackwater (i.e. cessation of drain pumping) and the more active approach at Moyarwood (i.e. blocking 591 592 of drains) have created a wet environment similar to the pre-disturbed ecosystem.

In terms of water chemistry, the electrical conductivity values varied between sites 593 594 with Moyarwood displaying values similar to a nutrient poor raised bog (Kettridge et al., 2011; Van der Schaaf et al., 2002), while the electrical conductivity values at Blackwater are 595 596 more consistent with nutrient rich peatlands (Van der Schaaf et al., 2002). The pH of both sites are comparable to natural sites, although the soil pH at Blackwater is at the lower range 597 of the mesotrophic category (Jeglum, 1971), similar to natural fens (Doyle and O' Críodáin, 598 2003). This is to be expected as (a) Blackwater is fed by relatively alkaline water influenced 599 by the limestone parent material beneath the peat and (b) the presence of residual fen peat 600 601 following extensive extraction of the more acidic upper peat layers.

602

603 *4.2 Species diversity* 

604 Species diversity is typical of the natural counterparts: typically low in the less degraded site at Moyarwood and with a higher number of species recorded in Blackwater due 605 to the water influx. The presence of monodominant stands such as P. australis and the 606 absence of a well-developed bryophyte layer at Blackwater signify a transition mire (from 607 608 open water to fen). If the site remains wet, the development of a new 'moderately rich' ecosystem is the most likely trajectory with an increased species of mosses. This may not 609 happen naturally, however, given the lack of seed banks in the locality and the difficulties in 610 reintroducing fen bryophytes in particular (Rochefort et al., 2016). Following the Canadian 611 612 experience on similar sites, intervention may be required with a combination of mechanized diaspore transfer and fertilization with phosphorus (the limiting nutrient in such sites and 613 present in very low amounts in Blackwater (0.033 %) (F. Renou-Wilson, unpublished data). 614 It may also be possible to transfer specific Sphagnum spp. since they are known to expand at 615 higher pH levels amongst fen communities if precipitation remains high (Vicherová et al., 616 2017). 617

On the other hand, increased frequency of dry events, whereby the water table drops below -20 cm may be a further obstacle to bryophyte establishment as grasses and forbs will compete with the existing Cyperaceae and Juncaceae species; typical species of degraded bogs that are present in the surrounding areas. This continued increase in species is not desirable from a biodiversity perspective (diversity of biological information) since homogenization is at play (i.e. where most of the new species found in a habitat are also found in other ecosystems in the locality).

625 The presence of Sphagnum capillifolium at Moyarwood is of high significance as it 626 indicates the presence of water table levels close to the surface and above. The presence of 627 other Sphagnum species such as S. papillosum and S. magellanicum strongly indicates that vegetation succession at this site is on the correct trajectory. The type of Sphagnum species 628 629 present is also critical for certain ecosystem processes, such as peat formation. For example, studies have shown that Sphagnum cuspidatum litter readily decomposes (Belyea, 1996; 630 Hogg, 1993), particularly the young stems (Limpens and Berendse, 2003). The Moyarwood 631 site has recovered a palette of Sphagnum species that has permitted the return of the C 632 633 sequestration function as well as increased biodiversity. The latter was also supported by the presence of other raised-bog specialized species (e.g. the carnivorous Drosera spp.) 634 confirming the return of wet and acidic environmental conditions but also demonstrates the 635 increased conservation value of the site, as these species do not occur in any other ecosystems 636 637 on the island.

### 639 *4.3 GHG dynamics*

640 The drained areas of both sites were annual CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> sources driven largely by soil temperatures (Figure 1, S3 in Supplemental Information). The annual values observed here 641 are within the range reported by Wilson et al. (2015) for a large number of peat extraction 642 sites in Ireland and the UK (that also used data from both the sites in this study), but lower 643 than the derived emission factors for drained peat extraction sites in the temperate zone 644 reported by Drösler et al. (2014). In the latter study, the CO<sub>2</sub> emission factor in particular was 645 646 strongly affected by data from Canadian peatland sites, where the CO<sub>2</sub> emissions were much higher than extraction sites in Europe (see Wilson et al. 2015, for a more detailed discussion). 647 While the CO<sub>2</sub> emissions reported for our sites are lower than other drained peatland land 648 uses (e.g. cropland, grassland) they are still substantial, especially when compared to mineral 649 650 soils (Abdalla et al., 2013). Therefore, if these emissions were replicated across the relatively large areas affected by peat extraction in Ireland (Malone and O'Connell, 2009), then these 651 652 degraded ecosystems represent a substantial hotspot of GHG emissions at the national scale (Wilson et al., 2013b). 653

654 Rewetting has had a significant impact on GHG dynamics at both sites in this study. Although, the rewetted area at Blackwater was found to be a net CO<sub>2</sub> source, rewetting still 655 represents a significant saving in terms of avoided emissions (and thereby has a direct climate 656 benefit) in comparison to the drained area (Fig. 8). The 4-year average value reported here for 657 the rewetted area at Blackwater ( $66 \pm 168 \text{ g CO}_2\text{-C m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1}$ ) is slightly higher than the Tier 1 658 value (0.50) for nutrient rich temperate peatlands derived by Blain et al. (2014) for the IPCC 659 Wetlands Supplement, although the very wide uncertainty range associated with our value is 660 indicative of a site that fluctuates considerably from sink to source over a short time scale 661 (i.e. 4 years). Nevertheless, it would suggest that the site has moved significantly along a 662 663 restoration/rehabilitation trajectory. However, GHG emissions/removals from the large body of open water at the site were not quantified in this study and could potentially represent 664 significant hotspots of CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> emissions. In the absence of truly comparable studies, 665 values reported by Franz et al. (2016) for a eutrophic rewetted fen would suggest that this 666 could be the case. Notwithstanding, there is potential for further improvements at this site, 667 particularly if *Phragmites* reeds were to colonize the open water area. Our results indicate 668 that *Phragmites* is an effective C sequestration species when water levels remain close to the 669 surface, as has been reported in other post-rewetting peatland studies (Günther et al., 2015; 670

Minke et al., 2016), but can quickly become a large CO<sub>2</sub> source during drier years (Günther 671 et al., 2015). Annual CH<sub>4</sub> emissions from *Phragmites* in this study were similar to those 672 reported by Huth et al. (2013) for a rewetted fen for a year with high rainfall, but lower than 673 values recorded in other comparable rewetted sites (Minke et al., 2016; van den Berg et al., 674 2016). However, some studies have shown that the measurement of CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes in *Phragmites* 675 stands with opaque chambers (as in this study) could be underestimated as emissions in these 676 plants are strongly controlled by light levels (Minke et al., 2014), although this effect may 677 only be an issue during mid-summer (Günther et al., 2014). Methane emissions from the 678 679 sedge microsite were low and comparable to natural peatland ecosystems (e.g. Laine et al., 2007). 680

Methane emissions at Moyarwood in the first two years post-rewetting were higher, 681 particularly in comparison to natural sites (e.g. Laine et al., 2007; Levy and Gray, 2015). It 682 may be possible that the high initial CH<sub>4</sub> emissions will decline over time as the litter 683 inundated during rewetting activities is decomposed (Limpens et al., 2008); GHG monitoring 684 is ongoing at the site and an extended dataset will provide valuable information. Over the 2-685 year study period, Moyarwood was a small net annual CO<sub>2</sub> sink (with high uncertainty 686 associated with the estimate) and exhibited values similar to natural sites (e.g. McVeigh et 687 688 al., 2014). Although rainfall was similar between the two sites for most of the summer months in 2013, the monthly value for July in Moyarwood (101.5 mm), however, was over 689 690 twice as high as recorded for the Blackwater area (42 mm) and undoubtedly ensured that the former site acted as an annual CO<sub>2</sub> sink, even in that relatively "dry" year. Moreover, the 691 692 abundance of Sphagnum species at Moyarwood may have (a) acted as a buffer to the droughtlike conditions (particularly as the rainfall in July would have rehydrated the mosses) and 693 694 may have helped prevent excessive water drawdown during that period similar to natural bogs (Waddington et al., 2011) and (b) enhanced  $CO_2$  uptake simply because they 695 696 decompose much more slowly than other species (Clymo, 1965). Nitrous oxide fluxes were not detected at either site, as also reported for some rewetted peatlands (e.g. Günther et al., 697 2015; Minke et al., 2016; Wilson et al., 2016b), although low N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes have been reported 698 for other rewetted studies (see Wilson et al., 2016a). 699

700

701 4.4 Synergies

Successful rewetting of degraded peatlands is a major challenge and, in some cases, may be a
 balancing act between biodiversity or climate benefits. In this study, the climate benefits from
 rewetting were slightly higher at Moyarwood where the strong CO<sub>2</sub> sink function offset the

705 substantial CH<sub>4</sub> emissions (Table 4). Nonetheless, both sites have a warming impact on the 706 climate and are clearly some distance away from functioning like natural sites (Fig. 8). Moreover, emissions from the open water at Blackwater (if quantified) could produce a 707 situation where rewetting may actually be more deleterious for the climate than drainage, 708 709 particularly if CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from drained areas were relatively low compared to other drained peatlands (Drösler et al. 2014). However, in regard to biodiversity provision, 710 Moyarwood was clearly superior to Blackwater in all aspects (Table 4) and would indicate 711 that rewetting of this land use category could provide the desired synergies between climate 712 713 regulation and biodiversity provision.



714

**Fig. 8** Greenhouse gas balance (tonnes  $CO_2$ -eq. ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) at the drained and rewetted sites at 715 Blackwater and Moyarwood. Dissolved organic carbon (DOC) and CH<sub>4</sub> emissions from 716 drainage ditches were calculated using guidance provided by IPCC (IPCC, 2014). Methane 717 and N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes are converted to CO<sub>2</sub>-equivalents (t CO<sub>2</sub>-eq ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) according to their 718 719 global warming potential (GWP) on a 100-year timescale:  $CH_4 = 28$  and  $N_2O = 265$  (Myhre et al., 2013). Error bars indicate standard deviation (not available for Conwy). Positive values 720 721 indicate a net warming impact on the climate and negative values indicate a net cooling impact. Ombrotrophic sites within the British Isles with long-term GHG datasets (>4 years) 722 at Bellacorick, Ireland (Wilson et al., 2016b), Glencar, Ireland (Koehler et al., 2011; 723

McVeigh et al., 2014), Auchencorth Moss, Scotland (Dinsmore et al., 2010; Dinsmore et al.,
2013; Helfter et al., 2015), Forsinard, Scotland (Levy and Gray, 2015) and Conwy, Wales
(CEH, unpublished data) are shown for comparative purposes.

727

#### 728 **5.** Conclusions

In Ireland, the current state of peatlands and the consequences of widespread degradation in 729 terms of loss of various ecosystem services have been highlighted (e.g. Renou-Wilson et al., 730 731 2011; Wilson et al., 2013b), thereby establishing a framework for the development of the first 732 National Peatlands Strategy (NPWS, 2015). Rewetting as an initial step towards restoration or towards new functioning ecosystems is called upon to meet not only the biodiversity 733 targets but also climate change mitigation targets. However, from an economic point of view 734 it is clearly impossible to rewet all the degraded peatland sites, assuming that they could be 735 rewetted in the first instance (Andersen et al., 2016). Instead, it is more realistic to target 736 specific sites that maximize the synergistic benefits of biodiversity provision and climate 737 change mitigation and, therefore, provide effective cost benefits (Bonn et al., 2014). 738

739 The results from this study would indicate that raised bogs, which have been degraded 740 through drainage and domestic extraction on the margins, could be prime candidates for 741 future peatland restoration efforts in Ireland in that they provide suitable synergies between climate change mitigation and biodiversity provision. However, we accept that this 742 743 prioritizing approach could mean that some industrial extraction sites will remain drained even after extraction has ceased. Nonetheless, given the large areas potentially associated 744 745 with this land use category (38% of the national peatland resource versus 7% for industrial extraction) (Malone and O'Connell, 2009), actions (both financial and practical) should be 746 747 directed at suitable sites that can be (a) successfully rewetted and (b) provide the biodiversity/climate benefits outlined above. Site-specific evaluations (micro-habitat and 748 749 vegetation assessment), regardless of land use category, prior to the initiation of restoration actions, would also be valuable for the decision making process. In this regard, hydrological 750 modelling (Mackin et al., 2017) and remote sensing techniques (e.g. Connolly and Holden, 751 2017) would also provide critical information to allow for targeted conservation, rewetting or 752 753 restoration efforts but these approaches must be backed up by appropriate fiscal instruments either through direct funding from government or from carbon/biodiversity offset schemes, 754 755 such as in operation in other jurisdictions (Tanneberger and Wichtmann, 2011).

756

#### 757 Acknowledgements

- 758 The project was funded by Bord na Móna, and the Environmental Protection Agency, Ireland
- under the Climate Change Research Programme (Project code: 2012-B-MS-9). We would
- 760 like to thank Ronan Connolly for assistance during field work and Ignatius Kelly for help in
- setting up the GHG monitoring site at Blackwater. Grateful thanks to Chris Evans (CEH) for
- the data used in Figure 8 (Conwy site). We thank the three anonymous reviewers for their
- 764

# 765 **References**

- Abdalla, M., Saunders, M., Hastings, A., Williams, M., Smith, P., Osborne, B., Lanigan,
  G., Jones, M.B., 2013. Simulating the impacts of land use in Northwest Europe on
  Net Ecosystem Exchange (NEE): The role of arable ecosystems, grasslands and forest
  plantations in climate change mitigation. Science of the Total Environment
  http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2012.1012.1030.
- Alm, J., Shurpali, N.J., Tuittila, E.-S., Laurila, T., Maljanen, M., Saarnio, S., Minkkinen,
   K., 2007. Methods for determining emission factors for the use of peat and peatlands flux measurements and modelling. Boreal Environment Research. 12, 85-100.
- Andersen, R., Farrell, C., Graf, M., Muller, F., Calvar, E., Frankard, P., Caporn, S.,
  Anderson, P., 2016. An overview of the progress and challenges of peatland
  restoration in Western Europe. Restoration Ecology. 25, 271-282.
- Atherton, I., Bosanquet, S., Lawley, M.,2010. Mosses and Liverworts of Britain and Ireland:
   a field guide. British Bryological Society. UK. pp. 856.
- Barthelmes, A., 2016. The global potential and perspectives for paludiculture. In: Wichtmann
  W., Schröder C., Joosten H., (Eds.), Paludiculture productive use of wet peatlands
  Climate protection biodiversity regional economic benefits. Schweizerbart
  Science Publishers. Stuttgart, Germany. pp. 200-203.
- Beetz, S., Liebersbach, H., Glatzel, S., Jurasinski, G., Buczko, U., Höper, H., 2013. Effects
  of land use intensity on the full greenhouse gas balance in an Atlantic peat bog.
  Biogeosciences. 10, 1067-1082.
- Belyea, L.R., 1996. Separating the effects of litter quality and microenvironment on
  decomposition rates in a patterned peatland. Oikos. 77, 529-539.
- Blain, D., Murdiyarso, D., Couwenberg, J., Nagata, O., Renou-Wilson, F., Sirin, A.,
  Strack, M., Tuittila, E.S., Wilson, D., 2014. Chapter 3. Rewetted organic soils. In:
  Hiraishi T., Krug T., Tanabe K., Srivastava N., Baasansuren J., Fukuda M., Troxler
  T.G., (Eds.), 2013 Supplement to the 2006 IPCC Guidelines for National Greenhouse
  Gas Inventories: Wetlands. Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. Switzerland.
  pp.

- Bonn, A., Reed, M.S., Evans, C.D., Joosten, H., Bain, C., Farmer, J., Emmer, I.,
  Couwenberg, J., Moxey, A., Artz, R., Tanneberger, F., von Unger, M., Smyth, M.A., Birnie, D., 2014. Investing in nature: Developing ecosystem service markets for
  peatland restoration. Ecosystem Services. 9, 54-64,
  DOI:10.1016/j.ecoser.2014.1006.1011.
- Caffrey, J.M., Baars, J.-R., Barbour, J.H., Boets, P., Boon, P., Davenport, K., Dick, J.,
  Early, J., Edsman, L., Gallagher, C., Gross, J., Heinimaa, P., Horrill, C., Hudin, S.,
  Hulme, P.D., Hynes, S., MacIsaac, J., McLoone, P., Millane, M., Moen, T.,
  Moore, N., Newman, J., O'Conhuir, R., O'Farrell, M., O'Flynn, C., Oidtmann, B.,
  Renals, T., Ricciarid, A., Roy, H., Shaw, S.C., van Valkenbur, J., Weiyl, O.,
  William, F., Lucy, F., 2014. Tackling invasive alien species in Europe: the top 20
  issues. Management of biological invasions. 5, 1-20.
- CBD. 2010. The Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011-2020 and the Aichi Biodiversity
   Targets. Convention on Biological Diversity. Nagoya, Japan, 18-29 October 2010. pp.
   13.
- Chapman, S., Buttler, A., Francez, A.-J., Laggoun Défarge, F., Vasander, H., Schloter,
  M., Combe, J., Grosvernier, P., Harms, H., Epron, D., Gilbert, D., Mitchell, E.,
  2003. Exploitation of northern peatlands and biodiversity maintenance: a conflict
  between economy and ecology. Front Ecol Environ. 1, 525-532.
- Christensen, T., R, Jackowicz-Korczyński, M., Aurela, M., Crill, P., Heliasz, M.,
  Mastepanov, M., Friborg, T., 2012. Monitoring the multi-year carbon balance of a
  subarctic palsa mire with micrometeorological techniques. AMBIO. 41, 207-217.
- Clymo, R.S., 1965. Experiments on breakdown of Sphagnum in two bogs. The Journal of
   Ecology. 53, 747-758.
- Cobbaert, D., Rochefort, L., Price, J.S., 2004. Experimental restoration of a fen plant
   community after peat mining. Applied Vegetation Science. 7, 209-220.
- Connolly, J., Holden, N.M., 2017. Detecting peatland drains with Object Based Image
   Analysis and Geoeye-1 imagery. Carbon Balance and Management. 12:7, 1-13.
- Dinsmore, K.J., Billet, M.F., Skiba, U.M., Rees, R.M., Drewer, J., Helfter, C., 2010. Role
  of the aquatic pathway in the carbon and greenhouse gas budgets of a peatland
  catchment. Global Change Biology. 16, 2750-2762.
- Dinsmore, K.J., Billett, M.F., Dyson, K.E., 2013. Temperature and precipitation drive
  temporal variability in aquatic carbon and GHG concentrations and fluxes in a
  peatland catchment. Global Change Biology. 19, 2133-2148.
- Dinsmore, K.J., Skiba, U.M., Billett, M.F., Rees, R.M., Drewer, J., 2009. Spatial and
   temporal variability in CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes from a Scottish ombrotrophic peatland:
   Implications for modelling and up-scaling. Soil Biology and Biochemistry. 41, 1315 1323.
- Boyle, G., O' Críodáin, C., 2003. Peatlands fens and bogs. In: Otte M., (Eds.), Wetlands of
   Ireland. University College Dublin Press. Dublin, Ireland. pp. pp. 256.

- 834 Drösler, M., Verchot, L., Freibauer, A., Pan, G., Evans, C.D., Bourbonniere, R.A., Alm, J.P., Page, S., Agus, F., Hergoualc'h, K., Couwenberg, J., Jauhiainen, J., Sabiham, 835 S., Wang, C., Srivastava, N., Bourgeau-Chavez, L.L., Hooijer, A., Minkkinen, K., 836 French, N., Strand, T., Sirin, A., Mickler, R., Tansey, K., Larkin, N., 2014. Chapter 837 2: Drained Inland Organic Soils. In: Hiraishi T., Krug T., Tanabe K., Srivastava N., 838 Baasansuren J., Fukuda M., Troxler T.G., (Eds.), 2013 Supplement to the 2006 IPCC 839 Guidelines for National Greenhouse Gas Inventories: Wetlands. Intergovernmental 840 Panel on Climate Change. Switzerland. pp. 841
- Buffy, P., Hanley, E., Black, K., O'Brien, P., Hyde, B., Ponzi, J., Alam, S., 2015. National
  Inventory Report 2015. Greenhouse gas emissions 1990-2013 reported to the United
  Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change. pp. 581.
- Ellenberg, H., Leuschner, C., 2010. Chapter 27: Zeigerwerte der Pflanzen Mitteleuropas.
  Vegetation Mitteleuropas mit den Alpen. UTB. Stuttgart, Germany. pp. 109.
- Evans, C.D., Page, S.E., Jones, T., Moore, S., Gauci, V., Laiho, R., Hruška, J., Allott,
  T.E.H., Billett, M.F., Tipping, E., Freeman, C., Garnett, M.H., 2014. Contrasting
  vulnerability of drained tropical and high-latitude peatlands to fluvial loss of stored
  carbon. Global Biogeochemical Cycles. 28, 2013GB004782.
- Fallon, D., McCorry, M.J., Farrell, C., Moran, J., 2012. Ten years in rehab. What have we
  learnt from Mayo? In: Magnusson T., (Eds.), 14th International Peat Congress.
  Stockholm, Sweden. Extended abstract 201. 185.
- Farrell, C.A., 2008. The biodiversity value and future management of degraded peatland
  habitats in Ireland. In: Feehan J., Farrell C.A., (Eds.), 13th International Peat
  Congress. Tullamore, Ireland. 686-689.
- Fernandez, F., Connolly, K., Crowley, W., Denyer, J., Duff, K., Smith, G.D., 2014. Raised
  bog monitoring and assessment survey 2013. Irish Wildlife Manuals No 81: National
  Parks and Wildlife Service, Departments of Arts, Heritage and Gaeltacht, Dublin,
  Ireland. pp. 198.
- Fossitt, J.A., 2000. A guide to habitats in Ireland. The Heritage Council. Dublin. pp. 120.
- Franz, D., Koebsch, F., Larmanou, E., Augustin, J., Sachs, T., 2016. High net CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub>
  release at a eutrophic shallow lake on a formerly drained fen. Biogeosciences. 13,
  3051-3070.
- Frolking, S., Roulet, N.T., Fuglestvedt, J., 2006. How northern peatlands influence the
  Earth's radiative budget: sustained methane emission versus sustained carbon
  sequestration. Journal of Geophysical Research. 111, G01008,
  doi:01010.01029/02005JG000091.
- Glenk, K., Schaafsma, M., Moxey, A., Martin-Ortega, J., Hanley, N., 2014. A framework
   for valuing spatially targeted peatland restoration. Ecosystem Services. 9, 20-33.
- Goodrich, J.P., Campbell, D.I., Roulet, N.T., Clearwater, M.J., Schipper, L.A., 2015.
  Overriding control of methane flux temporal variability by water table dynamics in a
  Southern Hemisphere, raised bog. Journal of Geophysical Research: Biogeosciences.
  120, 819-831.

875 Green, S.M., Baird, A.J., 2017. Using 'snapshot' measurements of CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes from an ombrotrophic peatland to estimate annual budgets: interpolation versus modelling. 876 Mires and Peat. 19, Article 09, 01-09, DOI: 10.19189/MaP.12016.OMB.19254. 877 Günther, A., Huth, V., Jurasinski, G., Glatzel, S., 2015. The effect of biomass harvesting on 878 879 greenhouse gas emissions from a rewetted temperate fen. Global Change Biology: Bioenergy. 7, 1092-1106. 880 Günther, A.B., Huth, V., Jurasinski, G., Glatzel, S., 2014. Scale-dependent temporal 881 variation in determining the methane balance of a temperate fen. Greenhouse Gas 882 Measurement and Management DOI: 10.1080/20430779.20432013.20850395. 883 Hannigan, E., Mangan, R., Kelly-Quinn, M., 2011. Evaluation of the success of mountain 884 blanket bog pool restoration in terms of aquatic macro invertebrates. Biology and 885 Environment: Proceedings of the Royal Irish Academy. 111B, DOI: 886 10.3318/BIOE.2011.3111.3308. 887 Helfter, C., Campbell, C., Dinsmore, K.J., Drewer, J., Coyle, M., Anderson, M., Skiba, 888 U., Nemitz, E., Billett, M.F., Sutton, M.A., 2015. Drivers of long-term variability in 889 890 CO<sub>2</sub> net ecosystem exchange in a temperate peatland. Biogeosciences. 12, 1799-1811. Hill, M.O., Mountford, J.O., Roy, D.B., Bunce, R., 1999. Ellenberg's indicator values for 891 British plants: ECOFACT Research reoport series Volume 2, Technical Annex. 892 893 Centre for Ecology and Hydrology. Abbots Ripton. pp. Hill, M.O., Preston, C.D., Bosanquet, S., Roy, D.B., 2007. BRYOATT: Attributes of British 894 and Irish mosses, liverworts and hornworts. Centre for Ecology and Hydrology. 895 Huntingdon, Cambridgeshire, England. pp. 88. 896 Hogg, E.H., 1993. Decay potential of hummock and hollow sphagnum peats at different 897 898 depths in a Swedish raised bog. Oikos. 66, 269-278. 899 Houghton, R.A., House, J.I., Pongratz, J., van der Werf, G.R., DeFries, R.S., Hansen, M.C., Le Quéré, C., Ramankutty, N., 2012. Carbon emissions from land use and 900 land-cover change. Biogeosciences. 9, 5125-5142. 901 Huth, V., Günther, A., Jurasinski, G., Glatzel, S., 2013. The effect of an exceptionally wet 902 903 summer on methane effluxes from a 15-year re-wetted fen in north-east Germany. Mires and Peat. 13, Article 02, 01-07. http://www.mires-and-peat.net/, ISSN 1819-904 905 1754X. IPCC. 2006. IPCC Guidelines for National Greenhouse Gas Inventories. Prepared by the 906 907 National Greenhouse Gas Inventories programme. Volume 4. Eggleston H.S., Buendia L., Miwa K., Ngara T., Tanabe K.: IGES. Japan. pp. 169. 908 IPCC.2014. 2013 Supplement to the 2006 Inter-Governmental Panel on Climate Change 909 910 Guidelines for National Greenhouse Gas Inventories: Wetlands. IPCC, Switzerland. pp. 354. 911 Jeglum, J.K., 1971. Plant indicators of pH and water level in peatlands at Candle Lake, 912 Saskatchewan. Canadian Journal of Botany. 49, 1661-1676. 913

- Joosten, H., Tapio-Biström, M.-L., Tol, S., 2012. Peatlands guidance for climate change
   mitigation through conservation, rehabilitation and sustainable use. Mitigation of
   Climate Change in Agriculture (MICCA) Programme. pp. 100.
- Kent, M., Coker, P.,1992. Vegetation description and analysis: a practical approach. John
  Wiley & Sons Ltd. Chichester, England. pp. 363.
- Kettridge, N., Binley, A., Green, S.M., Baird, A.J., 2011. Ebullition events monitored from northern peatlands using electrical imaging. Journal of Geophysical Research:
  Biogeosciences. 116, G04004, doi:04010.01029/02010JG001561.
- Knox, S.H., Sturtevant, C., Matthes, J.H., Koteen, L., Verfaillie, J., Baldocchi, D., 2015.
   Agricultural peatland restoration: effects of land-use change on greenhouse gas (CO<sub>2</sub>
   and CH<sub>4</sub>) fluxes in the Sacramento-San Joaquin Delta. Global Change Biology. 21,
   750-765.
- Koehler, A.-K., Sottocornola, M., Kiely, G., 2011. How strong is the current carbon
  sequestration of an Atlantic blanket bog? Global Change Biology. 17, 309-319.

Lachance, D., Lavoie, C., 2004. Vegetation of Sphagnum bogs in highly disturbed
landscapes: relative influence of abiotic and anthropogenic factors. Applied
Vegetation Science. 7, 183-192.

Laine, A., Wilson, D., Kiely, G., Byrne, K.A., 2007. Methane flux dynamics in an Irish
lowland blanket bog. Plant and Soil. 299, 181-193.

Le Quéré, C., Andrew, R.M., Canadell, J.G., Sitch, S., Korsbakken, J.I., Peters, G.P., 933 934 Manning, A.C., Boden, T.A., Tans, P.P., Houghton, R.A., Keeling, R.F., Alin, S., 935 Andrews, O.D., Anthoni, P., Barbero, L., Bopp, L., Chevallier, F., Chini, L.P., Ciais, P., Currie, K., Delire, C., Doney, S.C., Friedlingstein, P., Gkritzalis, T., 936 937 Harris, I., Hauck, J., Haverd, V., Hoppema, M., Klein Goldewijk, K., Jain, A.K., Kato, E., Körtzinger, A., Landschützer, P., Lefèvre, N., Lenton, A., Lienert, S., 938 Lombardozzi, D., Melton, J.R., Metzl, N., Millero, F., Monteiro, P.M.S., Munro, 939 D.R., Nabel, J.E.M.S., Nakaoka, S.I., O'Brien, K., Olsen, A., Omar, A.M., Ono, 940 T., Pierrot, D., Poulter, B., Rödenbeck, C., Salisbury, J., Schuster, U., Schwinger, 941 J., Séférian, R., Skjelvan, I., Stocker, B.D., Sutton, A.J., Takahashi, T., Tian, H., 942 Tilbrook, B., van der Laan-Luijkx, I.T., van der Werf, G.R., Viovy, N., Walker, 943 A.P., Wiltshire, A.J., Zaehle, S., 2016. Global Carbon Budget 2016. Earth Syst Sci 944 Data. 8, 605-649. 945

- Levy, P.E., Gray, A., 2015. Greenhouse gas balance of a semi-natural peatbog in northern
   Scotland. Environmental Research Letters. 10, 094019.
- Limpens, J., Berendse, F., 2003. How litter quality affects mass loss and N loss from
   decomposing Sphagnum. Oikos. 103, 537-547.
- Limpens, J., Berendse, F., Blodau, C., Canadell, J.G., Freeman, C., Holden, J., Roulet, N.,
   Rydin, H., Schaepman-Strub, G., 2008. Peatlands and the carbon cycle: from local
   processes to global implications a synthesis. Biogeosciences. 5, 1475-1491.
- Lloyd, J., Taylor, J.A., 1994. On the temperature dependence of soil respiration. Functional
   Ecology. 8, 315-323.

- Mackin, F., Flynn, R., Barr, A., Fernandez-Valverde, F., 2017. Use of geographical
  information system-based hydrological modelling for development of a raised bog
  conservation and restoration programme. Ecological Engineering. 106, Part A, 242252.
- Malone, S., O'Connell, C., 2009. Irelands Peatland Conservation Action Plan 2020 Halting
   the loss of biodiversity. Irish Peatland Conservation Council. pp. 152.
- Martin-Ortega, J., Glenk, K., Byg, A., 2017. How to make complexity look simple?
   Conveying ecosystems restoration complexity for socio-economic research and public engagement. PLoS ONE. 12, e0181686.
- McDonald, T., Gann, G.D., Jonson, J., Dixon, K.W., 2016. International standards for the
   practice of ecological restoration including principles and key concepts. Society for
   Ecological Restoration (SER). Washington D.C., USA. pp. 47.
- McVeigh, P., Sottocornola, M., Foley, N., Leahy, P., Kiely, G., 2014. Meteorological and
   functional response partitioning to explain interannual variability of CO<sub>2</sub> exchange at
   an Irish Atlantic blanket bog. Agricultural and Forest Meteorology. 194, 8-19.
- Minayeva, T., Bragg, O.M., Sirin, A.A., 2017. Towards ecosystem-based restoration of
  peatland biodiversity. Mires and Peat. 19, Article 01, 01-36, DOI:
  10.19189/MaP.12013.OMB.19150.
- Minke, M., Augustin, J., Burlo, A., Yarmashuk, T., Chuvashova, H., Thiele, A.,
  Freibauer, A., Tikhonov, V., Hoffmann, M., 2016. Water level, vegetation
  composition, and plant productivity explain greenhouse gas fluxes in temperate
  cutover fens after inundation. Biogeosciences. 13, 3945-3970.
- Minke, M., Augustin, J., Hagemann, U., Joosten, H., 2014. Similar methane fluxes
  measured by transparent and opaque chambers point at belowground connectivity of
  Phragmites australis beyond the chamber footprint. Aquatic Botany. 113, 63-71.
- Myhre, G., Shindell, D., Bréon, F.-M., Collins, W., Fuglestvedt, J., Huang, J., Koch, D., 980 Lamarque, J.-F., Lee, L., Mendoza, B., Nakajima, T., Robock, A., Stephens, G., 981 982 Takemura, T., Zhang, H., 2013. Anthropogenic and Natural Radiative Forcing. In: Stocker T.F., Qin D., Plattner G.-K., Tignor M., Allen S.K., Boschung J., Nauels A., 983 Xia Y., Bex V., Midgley P.M., (Eds.), Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science 984 Basis Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the 985 Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. Cambridge University Press. 986 Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA. pp. 659-740. 987
- 988 NPWS. 2015. National Peatlands Strategy. National Parks & Wildlife Service, Department of
   989 Arts, Heritage and the Gaeltacht. Dublin, Ireland. pp. 84.
- NPWS. In press. National Raised Bog SAC Management Plan Draft. National Parks and
   Wildlife Service, Department of Arts, Heritage and the Gaeltacht. Dublin. pp. 122.
- Page, S.E., Baird, A.J., 2016. Peatlands and Global Change: Response and Resilience.
  Annual Review of Environment and Resources. 41, 35-57.

- Parish, F., Sirin, A., Charman, D., Joosten, H., Minayeva, T., Silvius, M., Stringer, I.,
  2008. Assessment on peatlands, biodiversity and climate change. Main report. Global
  Environment Centre, Kuala Lumpur and Wetlands International. Wageningen,
  Netherlands. pp. 179.
- Parnell, J., Curtis, T.,2012. Webb's An Irish Flora (8th edition). Cork University Press. Cork,
  Ireland. pp. 560.
- Pasquet, S., Pellerin, S., Poulin, M., 2015. Three decades of vegetation changes in peatlands
   isolated in an agricultural landscape. Applied Vegetation Science. 18, 220-229.
- Renou-Wilson, F., Barry, C., Müller, C., Wilson, D., 2014. The impacts of drainage,
  nutrient status and management practice on the full carbon balance of grasslands on
  organic soils in a maritime temperate zone. Biogeosciences. 11, 4361-4379.
- Renou-Wilson, F., Bolger, T., Bullock, C., Convery, F., Curry, J.P., Ward, S., Wilson, D.,
  Müller, C., 2011. BOGLAND Sustainable Management of Peatlands in Ireland.
  STRIVE Report No 75 prepared for the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA).
  Johnstown Castle, Co. Wexford, Ireland. pp. 157.
- Renou-Wilson, F., Müller, C., Moser, G., Wilson, D., 2016. To graze or not to graze? Four
  years GHG balances and vegetation composition from a drained and a rewetted
  organic soil under grassland. Agriculture, Ecosystem and the Environment. 222, 156170.
- 1013 Renou-Wilson, F., Wilson, D., Rigney, C., Byrne, K., Farrell, C., Müller, C., 2018.
  1014 Network Monitoring Rewetted and Restored Peatlands/Organic Soils for Climate and
  1015 Biodiversity Benefits (NEROS project Synthesis Report). EPA Research Report No
  1016 236. Environmental Protection Agency. Wexford, Ireland. pp. 49.
- Robroek, B.J.M., Limpens, J., Breeuwer, A., Schouten, M.G.C., 2007. Effects of water level
  and temperature on performance of four *Sphagnum* mosses. Plant Ecology. 190, 971019
- Rochefort, L., 2000. Sphagnum: A Keystone Genus in Habitat Restoration. The Bryologist.
   103, 503-508.
- Rochefort, L., LeBlanc, M.-C., Bérubé, V., Hugron, S., Boudreau, S., Pouliot, R., 2016.
   Reintroduction of fen plant communities on a degraded minerotrophic peatland.
   Botany 1041-1051.
- Roulet, N.T., Lafleur, P.M., Richard, P.J.H., Moore, T., Humphreys, E.R., Bubier, J., 2007.
  Contemporary carbon balance and late Holocene carbon accumulation in a northern
  peatland. Global Change Biology. 13, 397-411, doi:310.1111/j.13652486.2006.01292.
- Schouten, M.G.C.,2002. Conservation and restoration of raised bogs: geological,
   hydrological and ecological studies. Department of the Environmental and Local
   Government. Staatsboshbeheer, The Netherlands. pp. 220.
- Smith, G.F., O'Donoghue, P., O'Hora, K., Delaney, E., 2011. Best practice guidance for
   habitat survey and mapping. The Heritage Council, Ireland. pp. 132.

- 1034 Smith, P., Bustamante, M., Ahammad, H., Clark, H., Dong, H., Elsiddig, E.A., Haberl, H., Harper, R., House, J., Jafari, M., Masera, O., Mbow, C., Ravindranath, N.H., 1035 Rice, C.W., Robledo Abad, C., Romanovskaya, A., Sperling, F., Tubiello, F., 2014. 1036 1037 Agriculture, Forestry and Other Land Use (AFOLU). In: Edenhofer O., Pichs-Madruga R., Sokona Y., Farahani E., Kadner S., Seyboth K., Adler A., Baum I., 1038 Brunner S., Eickemeier P., Kriemann B., Savolainen J., Schlömer S., von Stechow C., 1039 1040 Zwickel T., Minx J.C., (Eds.), Climate Change 2014: Mitigation of Climate Change Contribution of Working Group III to the Fifth Assessment Report of the 1041 Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. Cambridge University Press. 1042 1043 Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA. pp. 811-922. 1044 Strack, M., Zuback, Y.C.A., 2013. Annual carbon balance of a peatland 10 yr following 1045 restoration. Biogeosciences. 10, 2885-2896. 1046 Tanneberger, F., Wichtmann, W., 2011. Carbon credits from peatland rewetting: Climate biodiversity - land use. Schweizerbart Science Publishers. Stuttgart, Germany. pp. 1047 223. 1048 1049 Tiemeyer, B., Albiac Borraz, E., Augustin, J., Bechtold, M., Beetz, S., Beyer, C., Drösler, M., Ebli, M., Eickenscheidt, T., Fiedler, S., Förster, C., Freibauer, A., Giebels, M., 1050 1051 Glatzel, S., Heinichen, J., Hoffmann, M., Höper, H., Jurasinski, G., Leiber-Sauheitl, K., Peichl-Brak, M., Roßkopf, N., Sommer, M., Zeitz, J., 2016. High 1052 emissions of greenhouse gases from grasslands on peat and other organic soils. Global 1053 1054 Change Biology 10.1111/gcb.13303. 1055 Tuittila, E.-S., Komulainen, V.-M., Vasander, H., Laine, J., 1999. Restored cut-away peatland as a sink for atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. Oecologia. 120, 563 - 574. 1056 Urbanová, Z., Picek, T., Bárta, J., 2011. Effect of peat re-wetting on carbon and nutrient 1057 1058 fluxes, greenhouse gas production and diversity of methanogenic archaeal 1059 community. Ecological Engineering. 37, 1017-1026. van den Berg, M., Ingwersen, J., Lamers, M., Streck, T., 2016. The role of Phragmites in the 1060 1061 CH<sub>4</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes in a minerotrophic peatland in southwest Germany. Biogeosciences. 13, 6107-6119. 1062 1063 Van der Schaaf, S., Streefkerk, J.G., Daly, D., Johnson, P., 2002. Regional hydrology. In: Schouten M.G.C., (Eds.), Conservation and Restoration of Raised Bogs: Geological, 1064 Hydrological and Ecological Studies. Department of the Environment and Local 1065 Government / Staatsbosbeheer. pp. 32-54. 1066 1067 Vanselow-Algan, M., Schmidt, S.R., Greven, M., Fiencke, C., Kutzbach, L., Pfeiffer, 1068 E.M., 2015. High methane emissions dominated annual greenhouse gas balances 30 years after bog rewetting. Biogeosciences. 12, 4361-4371. 1069 Vicherová, E., Hájek, M., Šmilauer, P., Hájek, T., 2017. Sphagnum establishment in 1070 alkaline fens: Importance of weather and water chemistry. Science of The Total 1071 Environment. 580, 1429-1438. 1072 Waddington, J.M., Lucchese, M.C., Duval, T.P., 2011. Sphagnum moss moisture retention 1073
- 1074 following the re-vegetation of degraded peatlands. Ecohydrology. 4, 359-366.

- Waddington, J.M., Tóth, K., Bourbonniere, R.A., 2008. Dissolved organic carbon export fom
   a cutover and restored peatland. Hydrological Processes. 22, 2215-2224.
- Whelan, P.,2011. Lichens of Ireland: An Illustrated Introduction. Collins Press. Cork, Ireland.
   pp. 160.
- Wilson, D., Alm, J., Riutta, T., Laine, J., Byrne, K.A., Farrell, E.P., Tuittila, E.-S., 2007a.
  A high resolution green area index for modelling the seasonal dynamics of CO<sub>2</sub>
  exchange in vascular plant peatland communities. Plant Ecology. 190, 37-51.
- Wilson, D., Blain, D., Couwenberg, J., Evans, C.D., Murdiyarso, D., Page, S., RenouWilson, F., Rieley, J., Sirin, A., Strack, M., Tuittila, E.-S., 2016a. Greenhouse gas
  emission factors associated with rewetting of organic soils. Mires and Peat. 17,
  Article 04, 01–28.
- Wilson, D., Dixon, S.D., Artz, R.R.E., Smith, T.E.L., Evans, C.D., Owen, H.J.F., Archer,
  E., Renou-Wilson, F., 2015. Derivation of greenhouse gas emission factors for
  peatlands managed for extraction in the Republic of Ireland and the United Kingdom.
  Biogeosciences. 12, 5291-5308.
- Wilson, D., Farrell, C., A., Müller, C., Hepp, S., Renou-Wilson, F., 2013a. Rewetted
  industrial cutaway peatlands in western Ireland: prime location for climate change
  mitigation? Mires and Peat. 11, Article 01, 01-22
- Wilson, D., Farrell, C., Fallon, D., Moser, G., Muller, C., Renou-Wilson, F., 2016b. Multiyear greenhouse gas balances at a rewetted temperate peatland. Global Change
  Biology. 22, 4080-4095, DOI: 4010.1111/gcb.13325.
- Wilson, D., Müller, C., Renou-Wilson, F., 2013b. Carbon emissions and removals from Irish
   peatlands: current trends and future mitigation measures. Irish Geography. 46, 1-23.
- Wilson, D., Tuittila, E.-S., Alm, J., Laine, J., Farrell, E.P., Byrne, K.A., 2007b. Carbon dioxide dynamics of a restored maritime peatland. Ecoscience. 14, 71-80.
- Ye, R., Horwath, W.R., 2016. Nitrous oxide uptake in rewetted wetlands with contrasting soil
   organic carbon contents. Soil Biology and Biochemistry. 100, 110-117.
- Yli-Petäys, M., Laine, J., Vasander, H., Tuittila, E.-S., 2007. Carbon gas exchange of a revegetated cut-away peatland five decades after abandonment. Boreal Environment Research. 12, 177-190.
- 1105

Supplementary Material Click here to download Supplementary Material: Supplemental information.docx